

对提升英语专业学生思辨能力的研究——基于教师反馈的自主写作修改

杨樱

文华学院

DOI:10.12238/er.v7i11.5577

摘要：本研究探讨了基于教师反馈的自主写作修改对提升英语专业学生思辨能力的影响，采用以思辨能力为导向的“导讲”模式，在文华学院英语专业二年级的《基础英语写作(二)》课程中，开展了一个学期的写作教学实践。通过对实验数据进行定量和定性分析，结果表明学生对自主写作修改的态度经历了从抵触到热情接纳的转变，写作内容在深度和广度上都有了显著改进，写作成绩得到提升，这表明自主修改对学生理解主题、深化思想和提高逻辑性等方面产生了显著的正面影响。

关键词：教师反馈；自主写作修改；思辨能力

中图分类号：G64 **文献标识码：**A

Research on Improving English Majors' Critical Thinking Ability——Independent Writing Revision based on Teacher Feedback

Ying Yang

Wenhua College

Abstract: This study discusses the influence of independent writing revision based on teachers' feedback on improving English majors' critical thinking ability. By adopting the critical thinking-oriented "guided lecture" mode, a semester's writing teaching practice was carried out in Basic English Writing (II) course for English majors of Wenhua College. Through the quantitative and qualitative analysis of the experimental data, the results show that students' attitude towards autonomous writing revision has changed from resistance to enthusiastic acceptance, and the writing content has been significantly improved in depth and breadth, and their writing scores have been improved, which shows that autonomous writing revision has a significant positive impact on students' understanding of the theme, deepening their thinking and improving their logic.

Keywords: Teacher feedback; Independent writing revision; Ability to analyse

引言

写作作为一种高强度的思维活动，批判性思维贯穿于它的整个过程：立意、构思、成文到修改，而自主修改是写好的本质。少量仅有的自主修改也大多停留在词语、语法等语言表层，无法深入解决语篇的可理解性、衔接性和连贯性等问题 (Sommers)。学习者缺乏写作修改策略被认为是一个重要因素 (National Assessment Of Educational Progress 1977)。de Beaugrande (1982) 曾发现，接受过作文修改策略训练的学生，自主写作修改能力会有明显提升。另外，写作动机强度和教师作文批改和反馈方式也会影响学习者的自主写作修改 (徐锦芬等 2004)。如何基于教师反馈，通过自主修改提升学生的思辨能力成为高校英语写作教学需要突破的问题。本文提出以思辨能力为导向的“导讲”模式，并在具体的教学实践中检验和分析了新模式的运用效果。

一、“导讲”模式在英语专业写作的应用

笔者在文华学院英语专业二年级的《基础英语写作(二)》课程上，按照自然班随机将学生分为实验组和对照组，开展了一个学期的教学实验。确保两组学生在上学期末英语写作考试成绩相近，且在写作兴趣、信心及课堂互动积极性等方面无显著差异，从而具备对比研究的价值。

为了保证实验的精确性和可靠性，以及最大程度地验证“导讲”模式的效果，在实验期间，除自主修改环节外，教师提供了个性化的指导，并要求学生进行修改成果展示，其余条件如教学时长、教学环境、教学资源分配以及整体教学方法保持一致。

(一) 教师指导

首先，培养学生自主修改的意识。常规教学中，教师通常不会对学生施加过于严格的要求，且常常忽视对自主修改

写作技巧的具体指导, 导致学生对此方面缺乏自觉性, 以致相同或相似的写作问题循环出现, 严重影响了写作质量和能力的提升。实验初期, 特别强调自主修改在提高写作品质中的关键地位, 加深学生对这一理念的理解, 并明确规定学生必须根据教师提供的建议进行多轮修改直至达成满意的标准。实验选择议论文作为培养学生批判性思维能力的主要文体, 主要基于两点原因: 一方面, 议论文是英语写作训练和各类考试中频繁涉及的文体类型, 具有较强的现实操作价值; 另一方面, 相较于记叙文和说明文, 议论文对作者的思维严谨程度要求更高, 它不再局限于对客观事物的具象描述和解释, 而是要求作者在理性框架内对某个议题进行抽象分析和辩证思考。

接着, 以第一次学生习作“Internet: a blessing or a curse?”为例, 按照英语专业四级写作评分原则 (内容阐述能力 10

分+篇章组织能力 3分+语言运用能力 7分) 和标准进行分档打分, 并提供范例, 详细说明分值的组成。Sample 1 是优秀档 (10+3+5=18分): 文章观点清楚 (首段明确表明立场), 结构合理 (开头段与结尾段形成信息的闭环), 内容充实 (从三个方面论证了网络带给我们的便利), 语言运用得体。Sample 2 是尚可档 (7+3+4=14分): 文章观点明确 (网络的利大于弊), 结构完整, 内容尚可 (论证部分只提及利, 未涉及弊, 论证不充分), 语言表达通顺。Sample 3 是失败档 (2+2+2=6分): 文章没有达到写作要求 (篇幅严重不足), 论证不得力 (仅罗列事实, 未进行分析, 缺少段落主题句), 语言错误不少。通过对这些典型习作的逐一点评和剖析, 实验组学生得以清晰识别自身写作中存在的常见思维漏洞, 为后续的自主修改环节奠定了坚实的基础。

Sample 1

In recent year, with the development of science and technology, Internet has become increasingly prevalent in our daily life, which has brought us a lot of benefits but also trigger some enormous troubles. From my perspective, Internet is a blessing to our human being. It does more good than harm to our daily life. And there are a number of factors standing for my point.

Preliminarily, one of the common factors is that it enable us to gain the most current information without going out, whether they are as influential as international events or as tiny as common daily news and so on. Though the authenticity of these information doesn't have guarantee, we can choose the authoritative web sites to get information and sift them via our own mind.

Another reason contribute to my view is that Internet provides us variety kinds of ways to entertain ourselves during sparing time. This can be exemplified as playing games, watching videos, purchasing merchandises etc. Definitely there are many reports about Internet addiction since these entertainment ways can also induce us to waste our time. Whereas, if we can use Internet appropriately instead of over-obsessed in it, it will certainly be regarded as a beneficial thing.

And the most fundamental element is: it serves as a convenient way to communicate with other. In the past, we have to call others or have a face-to-face meeting with them to inform them something that is significant. While they are immersing in something else or their number is engaging, you can easily being left in suspense. Nevertheless, nowadays we can connect with others conveniently with QQ or Wechat.

To end up, these factors indicate that if used properly, Internet is certainly a blessing to our life.

Sample 2

Nowadays, public concern about whether the Internet is a blessing or a curse is picking up. As we all know, with the development of science and technology, the Internet has become an indispensable part of our daily life. It doesn't take a leap of imagination to find that the Internet is a curse from the point of view of human health. But overall the advantages outweigh disadvantages. Here are some details.

To begin with, the main function of the Internet is resource sharing. On the one hand, the Internet users can share all the resources with each other, so as to greatly improve the utilization rate of system resources. On the other hand, they can send all kinds of human information, data or E-mail timely and quickly, so that people are more closely connected. Moreover, the Internet can broaden our horizon, keep abreast of current events and obtain the latest knowledge and information. Not only can it promote personalized development, but also it can strengthen external exchanges. It creates a new virtual world for us to chat with friends, share our thoughts with others and relieve the pressure.

All in all, if we use the Internet properly, our life will become better and better!

Sample 3

In my opinion, internet is helpful to us. The first computer means that the world is going to be in a different way.

As you can see, now, the internet is widely used. We talk through QQ and WECHAT on the internet. And we buy life necessities on Taobao and Tmall. Besides, we also learn new things all around the world. No matter where are you, you could easily know everything all over the world. I could even say that if there is no more internet, our world would get into a mess. It's not a joke. It can be true.

Although it brings many troubles in the meanwhile, its beneficial is obligato. Therefore, the internet is beneficial to us.

随后,对频繁出现的思维缺陷进行了深入解析。融合本人近年来在写作教学领域积累的丰富经验,从内容的深度与结构的严谨性双重视角出发,归纳了英语专业学生在撰写议论文时常遭遇的若干思维误区。在此基础上,参考了文秋芳

与刘润清教授在2006年提出的“作文内容评估标准”,精心设计了一份“英语专业学生议论文写作典型问题汇总表”(表一),旨在为识别与修正这些常见问题提供一个系统性的框架。

表一

一级指标 (思辨能力)	二级指标 (关键词)	三级指标 (说明)	问题
阐释	文章切题性	切合题围,不跑题; 切合题旨,不偏题。	主题不明确; 偏离主题。
分析&解释	论点明确性	中心论点清楚、恰当; 分论点清楚、恰当。	无中心思想句; 有瑕疵的中心思想句(过于宽泛、 狭隘或多个观点的杂糅); 段落无主题句; 有瑕疵的主题句; 主题句与中心思想句不符或联系不 紧密。

评价&自我调节	说理透彻性	分论点论述逻辑性强， 举例恰当、具体。	论证不充分 (没有两个及以上分论点)； 论证牵强 (扩展句与主题句联系不紧密)； 分论点间主次不分明。
推论	篇章连贯性	各分论点之间的关系 符合逻辑，且清楚、明确。	逻辑顺序不当； 段落间过渡不顺畅。

最后，为每一位学生的习作定制个性化的反馈报告，确保指导的针对性与有效性。以附图所示的学生作文为例，笔者充分利用电子文档的“批注”工具，精准标记出文中的具

体问题区域。这一过程不仅直接指示出待改进之处，而且通过直观的互动方式促进了师生之间的有效沟通。

Sample 4 First draft

Is it good for us to install cameras?

With the continuous advancement and growth of science and technology, the application of imaging devices and surveillance equipment is becoming increasingly prevalent. The majority of individuals find the presence of a camera in their home to be highly convenient, whether it be for the purpose of thwarting theft or monitoring offspring. However, some individuals argue that the installation of cameras in various locations represents an encroachment on privacy and may lead to the acquisition of inaccurate information.

In my opinion, there is no issue with installing cameras in public spaces and on streets, which not only ensures the personal safety of our citizens but also serves as a behavioral constraint. The installation of cameras or listening devices in private areas depends on one's specific circumstances. If there is a genuine need for a camera to monitor and guarantee the safety of children or the elderly, it is a viable option. Moreover, having a camera in the home can indeed act as a deterrent and reduce the likelihood of theft.

However, I believe that even if you install cameras to monitor the safety of children and the elderly, you must also obtain the consent and opinions of the individuals being monitored before utilizing these devices. Otherwise, this act, even when carried out by a responsible guardian, constitutes an invasion of their privacy. When utilizing this type of camera and monitoring equipment, it is crucial to consider network security, as criminals can easily obtain the information captured by these devices through various methods, thereby potentially leaking your private information.

Moreover, the deployment of a camera is a two-edged sword, necessitating the exploitation of its benefits while mitigating its potential risks and drawbacks. Ultimately, technology should serve to enhance our lives.

The screenshot shows a document with several red annotations. On the right side, there is a sidebar with six red comment boxes, each starting with a person icon and the word '作者' (Author). The comments provide feedback on the student's writing, such as 'The thesis statement shows that you are supportive of installing cameras.', 'The next sentence focuses on "how to install cameras."', 'Then it reverts to the advantages of installing cameras.', 'The paragraph is discursive, mixture of different ideas.', 'This paragraph centers on "how".', and 'The reasoning body is not about the merits and demerits of surveillance cameras, so the conclusion is arbitrary.'

在此基础上，参照“问题汇总表”（表一），进一步提出细致入微的修改建议，具体方案汇总于“修改建议明细表”（表二）中。这样做旨在为学生提供清晰、可操作的指导方

针，帮助他们在逻辑构建、论据支持等方面实现全面提升，从而在自主修改的过程中，不仅纠正错误，更能在批判性思维与写作技巧上获得实质性的进步。

表二

思辨能力	具体问题	原因	修改建议
阐释	1.主题不明确 2.偏离主题	论证主体部分将“what” & “how” 杂糅	通过修改主体部分，凸显主旨“what”。
分析&解释	3.段落无主题句	主题不明	段落主题句围绕论题展开。

评价&自我调节	1.论证不充分 (没有两个及以上分论点)	无段落主题句	运用“摆事实、讲道理”等方法补充 supporting details.
推论	2.段落间过渡不顺畅	结束段与主体部分无任何关联	确保“论题、段落主题句、结论”的“三位一体”。

（二）学生讲解

为评估学生习作修订的成效，同时锻炼其综合技能并增强个人自信，本研究在实验组内推行了一项创新做法：邀请学生通过讲解的形式，展示其作品从初稿到终稿的显著蜕变过程。

具体实施中，遵循学号顺序，每次课开讲之前，精心安排四位学生进行汇报，确保所有学生均有平等的展示机会，以此全面激发群体参与感与学习主动性。为维持高参与度并促使全体学生主动思考，汇报之初，学生仅展示其未经修改的初稿，并由教师随机点名其他同学针对以下核心问题进行回答：

内容分析

- 1.文章的核心观点是什么？是否具有新颖性？
- 2.支撑观点的论据有哪些？
- 3.论据是否贴切且逻辑严密？哪些论据需进一步拓展？

Sample 4 Final draft

Surveillance devices: to be used or rejected?

As science and technology improve by leaps and bounds, more and more people choose to use surveillance devices to live a more convenient life. However, the benefits of installing surveillance devices are debatable. Some hold the view that using surveillance devices can be effective in preventing thefts and act as supervising babysitters for children. But others frown on this matter, they question the security of the surveillance devices, which they believe could reveal personal privacy and provide unreliable information. As for me, I'm in tune with the perspective that surveillance cameras are a force for good by providing security, recording of evidence and maintaining the social order.

Surveillance devices are good for providing us with security in several ways. Not only in home, but almost everywhere. The surveillance devices can detect abnormal situations in time and issue alarms to help us quickly respond to various security issues to effectively reduce security risks.

Surveillance devices are conducive to the record of evidence, which brings justice to innocent victims. Surveillance videos often play an important role in criminal investigations. And it is the surveillance camera footage that helps police rescue innocent victims.

Surveillance devices are a boon to maintain the social order. Installing security monitoring systems in public places can improve the public's sense of security. At the same time, security monitoring system is instrumental in the emergency rescue.

All in all, it is better to use surveillance devices to live a higher quality of life.

二、研究设计

本研究对学生的作文数量及修改频率进行了量化统计。为了确保反馈的一致性和准确性，所有的反馈均由笔者提供。同时，为了收集尽可能多的数据样本，每次作业都被全面批改。鉴于人力限制，研究选择了翻译专业的学生作为实

结构组织

每个段落是否具备明确的主题句？

段落间的过渡是否清晰流畅？

引言与结论是否有效起到了引领与总结的作用？

随后，基于同学们的即时反馈，汇报学生揭示其习作中存在的问题，并分享教师的具体修改意见。这一过程不仅使汇报学生扮演起“微讲师”的角色，促进了知识的迅速传播，还通过讲解的过程，加深了他们对教师指导内容的理解，并促使其将外来建议内化为个人的写作智慧。

汇报的高潮部分在于学生展示最终修订版，并详尽阐释每一处改动的意图。为清晰标示文章的结构与重点，要求学生使用不同色彩高亮显示文章的中心议题、各段落主题句及总结段落，从而直观展现修改思路与文章脉络的优化过程。此举不仅提升了汇报的直观性，也进一步巩固了学生对文章结构与内容组织原则的掌握。下图为 Sample 4 的定稿。

验对象，每两周布置一篇作文，共计批改了 160 篇作文，每位学生平均修改了 3 篇文章。此类数据分析的重点集中在自主修改的深度上，包括文章的内容和语篇结构（参见表二）。

在完成了 8 次写作任务之后，研究者在课堂上对参与自主修改的学生进行了问卷调查，旨在了解他们对于“导讲”

模式的认可程度,以及基于教师反馈的自主修改过程中的动机和态度。问卷包含20个封闭式问题和2个开放式问题。共发放了20份问卷,所有回收的数据均为有效数据。此外,还选取了4名学生进行了深度访谈。其中两人平均修改次数少于2次,而另外两人平均修改次数高于5次。

三、研究结果

(一) 自主写作修改的行为

从学生的自主写作修改频次来看,平均每篇文章被修改了3.58次。这一数字明显高于传统过程写作法中通常要求的三次修改(Clark, 2003)。在与学生的深度访谈中,我们了解到自主修改存在个体差异的原因主要有两个方面:一、学习动力:尽管这项任务是强制性的要求,但对于那些学习动力充沛并对写作抱有浓厚兴趣的学生来说,他们会追求完美,不断地改进自己的作品;而对于学习动力不足的学生,则可能仅仅满足于达到教师的基本要求。二、知识储备:对于那些拥有丰富知识储备并且具备发散性思维的学生来说,能够快速根据教师的修改建议激活已有的知识,并有效地进行论证;相比之下,知识储备不足的学生则需要更多的时间去查找相关信息,深入了解主题,因此他们的修改效率相对较低。

(二) 自主写作修改的动机和态度

基于调查问卷的结果,笔者发现近90%的学生对自主写作修改的态度经历了显著的变化,从最初的抵触转变为后来的热情接纳。学生们普遍认为教师的反馈为他们的自主修改明确了方向,“导讲”模式为他们注入了动力。无论是主题的理解,还是在思想的深度和广度上,以及所陈述观点的逻辑性等方面,他们都取得了显著的进步。

在动机方面,超过85%的学生表示最初只是因为教师的硬性要求才被动地进行修改;然而,随着“导讲”模式的实施和对自主修改流程的逐渐熟悉,他们开始非常乐意主动进行修改。其中有20%的学生甚至会进行额外的作文训练,并主动联系教师,讨论修改过程中的心得与疑问。

(三) 自主写作修改的效果

尽管本实验仅持续了一个学期,但仍取得了一些较为显著的效果。通过对定性数据(包括学生的作文和问卷中的开放式问题)的分析,87.6%的学生清楚地掌握了如何从内容和篇章层面区分一篇优秀的议论文,他们能够识别自己习作中常见的逻辑漏洞,并了解如何通过具体的论证方法来实现重点突出、论证充分、论据可信以及段落间紧密衔接的目的。

实验班与对照班期末成绩的对比进一步印证了这一点。实验班的平均成绩比对照班高出3.7分,尤其是在考察思辨

能力的题目上,如列出提纲、段落排序及段落写作等,实验班学生展现出明显的优势,极少出现偏离主题或逻辑混乱(即论题、段落主题句和结束段之间缺乏一致性)的情况。

为了进一步检测学生的思辨能力是否得到了提升,我们采用了“加利福尼亚批判性技能测试-2000”作为前测和后测的标准。该测试共有34道题。在前测中,实验班与对照班的成绩相当接近,约60%的学生正确解答的题目数量少于19道,显示出较弱的思辨能力,仅有1-2名学生正确解答的题目数量超过了28道,表现出较强的思辨能力。而在后测中,实验班的数据明显优于对照班,思辨能力达到中等水平(即正确解答20-28道题)的学生比例提高了20个百分点。

四、结语

本研究的结果表明,基于教师反馈的自主写作修改对于英语专业学生思辨能力的提升具有一定的积极作用。然而,在实际教学中,由于人力资源的限制,导致实验的规模受到了局限。如何在教学中通过多样化的教师反馈形式,并结合人工智能提供的在线反馈,有效地指导学生进行自主修改,仍然是一个值得深入探索的重要课题。

[参考文献]

- [1]徐锦芬,彭仁忠,吴卫平.非英语专业大学生自主性英语学习能力调查与分析[J].外语教学与研究,2004(1).
- [2]文秋芳,刘润清.从英语议论文分析大学生抽象思维特点[J].外国语,2006(2).
- [3]de Beaugrande, R. Psychology and composition: Past, present, and future [C]// M.Nystrand. What Writers Know: The Language, Process and Structure of Written Discourse. Orlando, FL: Academic Press, 1982.
- [4]National Assessment of Educational Progress. Write/rewrite: An Assessment of Revision Skills[R].Denver, Co.: Education Commission of the States, 1977.
- [5]Sommers, N. I. Revision in the Composing Process: A Case Study of College Freshmen and Experienced Adult Writers[M]. Boston: Boston University Press, 1978.

作者简介:

杨樱(1981.9-),女,汉族,湖北蕲春人,硕士,文华学院外语学部副教授,研究方向为英美文学。

基金项目:

本文系文华学院教改项目“自主写作修改对提升英语专业学生思辨能力的研究”(编号:J0900741425)的研究成果。